



# 开放时代

OPEN TIMES

## 2015.05

双月刊 总第263期

中文社会科学引文索引(CSSCI)来源期刊

中国人文社会科学核心期刊

中文核心期刊

黄宗智

农业合作化路径选择的两大盲点：东亚农业合作化历史经验的启示

严海蓉 陈义媛

中国农业资本化的特征和方向：自下而上和自上而下的资本化动力

丛小平

从“婚姻自由”到“婚姻自主”：20世纪40年代陕甘宁边区婚姻的重塑

朱嫦巧

“阈限族群”的文化表达

——以广州本土漫画为例

刘 巍

风起了，能否吹散刺耳的高音？

——有感于王汎森《执拗的低音》

ISSN 1004-2938



定价 人民币25元



## 开放时代

2015年第5期

(逢单月10日出版)

主管单位 广州市社会科学院  
主办单位 广州市社会科学院  
编辑出版 开放时代杂志社  
社 长 郭 凡  
特约主编 吴重庆  
执行主编 刘朝华

地 址: 广州市白云区新市街云安路119号  
邮 编: 510410  
电 话: (020)86464940 86464301  
传 真: (020)86464301  
电子邮箱: opentimes@vip.163.com  
出版刊号: ISSN1004-2938 CN44-1034/C  
邮发代号: 46-169  
国内发行: 广东省报刊发行局  
国外发行: 中国出版对外贸易总公司  
(北京782信箱)

装帧设计: 何建军  
印 刷: 广东广州日报传媒股份有限公司  
定 价: 人民币25元

# 目 录

## 专题: 中国农业的发展道路

严海蓉

“中国农业的发展道路”专题导言

13

黄宗智

农业合作化路径选择的两大盲点: 东亚农业合作化历史经验的启示

18

贺雪峰

为谁的农业现代化

36

严海蓉 陈义媛

中国农业资本化的特征和方向: 自下而上和自上而下的资本化动力

49

陈航英

新型农业主体的兴起与“小农经济”处境的再思考  
——以皖南河镇为例

70

黄 瑜

大资本农场不能打败家庭农场吗?  
——华南地区对虾养殖业的资本化过程

88

孙新华

农业规模经营主体的兴起与突破性农业转型  
——以皖南河镇为例

106

林 春

小农经济派与阶级分析派的分歧及共识  
——“中国农业的发展道路”专题评论

125

## 人文天地

丛小平

从“婚姻自由”到“婚姻自主”: 20世纪40年代陕甘宁边区婚姻的重塑

131

廉如鉴

土改时期的“左”倾现象何以发生

150

经济社会

朱嫦巧

“阈限族群”的文化表达  
——以广州本土漫画为例 163

批 评

刘 巍

风起了,能否吹散刺耳的高音?  
——有感于王汎森《执拗的低音》 184

阅 读

欧树军

反思民主,探寻民主 210

唐小兵

何种革命?谁的传统?  
——裴宜理《安源:发掘中国革命之传统》读后 219

英文目录

5

封二/封三:新书院之五——中和书院

韩 星

本刊推行匿名审稿制度

学术委员

(按姓氏拼音顺序排列)

陈春声 陈 来 陈少明 陈宜中  
 丁 耘 杜维明 范 可 甘 阳  
 郭于华 何高潮 何 明 贺雪峰  
 洪 涛 黄万盛 黄宗智 强世功  
 李艳红 林 春 刘 昶 刘民权  
 刘小枫 卢晖临 麻国庆 倪梁康  
 潘 毅 潘忠党 渠敬东 任剑涛  
 单世联 舒 炜 孙 歌 孙 江  
 万俊人 汪 晖 王绍光 王则柯  
 王正绪 韦 森 项 飏 肖 滨  
 徐滇庆 徐 勇 许纪霖 许章润  
 杨奎松 应 星 袁伟时 翟学伟  
 翟振明 张 静 张曙光 张志林  
 郑永年 郑振满 朱苏力 庄孔韶

《开放时代》已发表的文章(含原创图片),版权均归开放时代杂志社所有。除注明来源的引用外,未经本刊书面授权,不得转载、摘编、翻译或以其他任何形式使用,违者视为侵权,本刊将依法追究法律责任。本刊对作者不收取任何费用,从未授权任何机构和个人进行有偿组稿。

特此声明。

法律顾问 于 静

<p><b>OPEN TIMES</b></p> <p><b>5<sup>th</sup> ISSUE , 2015</b></p> <p><b>CONTENTS</b></p>
-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

**FEATURE TOPIC: THE DEVELOPMENTAL PATH OF CHINA'S AGRICULTURE**

Introduction 13

*Yan Hairong*

The Two Big Blind Spots in the Search for a Path for Agricultural Cooperatives: Lessons from the East Asian Experience 18

*Philip C. C. Huang*

**Abstract:** The Chinese government and many Chinese rural reconstruction movement supporters believe that agricultural cooperatives must be entirely voluntary peasant organizations. In addition, the government further believes that agricultural modernization must be based on large-scale farms. This article demonstrates that these are the two major blind spots today in the choice of a path for China's rural development. They do not accord with economic logic, nor do they accord with the most successful examples of the modernization path for a peasant economy -- of Japan, Korea, and Taiwan. The reason for the success of the East Asian historical experience is that the pre-War top-down agricultural administration of Japan (or its occupation), under post-War U.S. occupation or its decisive influence, was in large measure turned over to peasant coops, driving thereby the bottom-up democratization of the coops. At the same time, like the East Asian experience, what China needs is not "horizontally integrated" large-scale farms, but rather small farms that are "vertically integrated" in production, processing and marketing through coops, to solve thereby the problems of the small peasant facing alone the gigantic market. What such a path of development means is not the simple "private benefit" incentive system currently in use, but rather a publicized private benefit incentive system. That is what Chinese agriculture should choose today.

**Keywords:** Japanese agricultural administration, democratized coops, small farms vs. large farms, horizontal integration vs. vertical integration, private interests vs. public interests

## Agricultural Modernization for Whom?

36

*He Xuefeng*

**Abstract:** China's modernization and urbanization can only be a gradual process. At present, there are still more than 600 million rural population and more than two hundred million agricultural labor force in China, a reality that will limit China to the developmental path of small-scale farming economy for a long time to come. In other words, China's agricultural modernization should be based on small-scale operatives, not large ones, and should first of all respond to the needs of small-scale farmers in their production and life. At this stage, China's agriculture has three top agendas: first, ensuring food security; second, providing agricultural employment and agricultural income for hundreds of millions of farmers; and third, making agriculture a stabilizer for China's modernization. If the national policy can respond to the needs of small-scale farmers and address the contraction, inherent in the farming economy, between small-scale farming and socialized production the three top agendas mentioned above will be fulfilled and a reliable agricultural and rural basis will be secured for China's overall modernization.

**Keywords:** agricultural modernization, large-scale operation, small-scale farming economy, policy in favor of agriculture, middle-income trap

## Features and Direction of Agricultural Capitalization in China: Driving Forces, both Top-down and Bottom-up, of Capital

49

*Yan Hairong & Chen Yiyuan*

**Abstract:** With big pushes from the government, cooperatives, household farms and leading enterprises are rising as the new economic powers in China's rural areas and are becoming the major driving forces for China's agricultural development. The trend of capitalization in China's agriculture has been dubbed by Philip C. C. Huang as "capitalization without proletarianization". Based on both macroscopic and microscopic cases, this paper studies the capital accumulation in China's agriculture, its nature, tendency, features, and the policy changes that have gone along with it. The authors maintain that there are both top-down and bottom-up driving forces in the capitalization process. As a matter of fact, China's agricultural policy was alienated from small-scale farming even from the initial period of the rural reform.

**Keywords:** capital accumulation, agricultural capitalism, populism, Chayanov



The Rise of New-type Agricultural Subject and the Predicament of Small-scale Farming Economy:  
with He Town as the Example 70

*Chen Hangying*

Abstract: Along with the constant change of the agricultural land system and the heating up of land transfer-ence, China's small-scale farming economy is in accelerated disintegration and is being replaced by capitalized agriculture. From the perspective of production relationship and based on a constructive description of the mobility of land, labor force, agricultural services, foods and other important production and livelihood resources in a rural town in the south of Anhui Province, this essay suggests that two new groups are on the rise in China's agricultural production. One is the commonwealth made up of large-scale farming subjects, agricultural service providers, and food purchasing and processing entities. The other includes the ordinary farming households who are still legally in possession of the contract rights of the land. The former have abundant capitals and a domineering position in food production, agricultural service, and food sales and purchase. They are the leaders in capitalized agriculture. The latter are no longer the kind of small-scale farmers that they used to be in the initial period of the rural reform and have been reduced to semi-proletariats. The emergence of these two groups and the mobility of resources between them have greatly shattered the productive pattern of the small-scale farming economy and have put China's agricultural production on the road towards capitalism.

Keywords: new agricultural subject, mobility of resources, small-scale farming economy, agricultural transformation

Can't Farms with Large Capital Beat Household Farms? Capitalization of Prawn Aquaculture in  
South China 88

*Huang Yu*

Abstract: The low ratio of hired labor in China's agriculture has convinced quite a number of scholars that capitalization does not necessarily lead to proletarianization of the farmers. The author rejects this view by revealing the transformation of agricultural capitals from "nominal ownership" to "real ownership" in prawn aquaculture. In the early stage, due to both natural and social obstacles, capitals can only extract the farmers' values through monopolizing the production chain upstream and downstream. However, in recent years, after a few bouts of catastrophic prawn endemic, prawn farmers have to give up prawn business. Agricultural capitals cash in on this situation and achieve "real ownership." By tracing the development of a rising prawn aquaculture base in Leizhou, the author explores how agricultural capitals accomplish land transfer, technological control and labor supervision, and successfully mark up sales price in the low season. In this way, agricultural capitals are gradually driving household farms out of business. The analysis will give some insight into the dynamic process of class formation and the way in which farmers are being turned into proletariats.

Keywords: agricultural capitalization, real ownership, household farm, agricultural enterprise, prawn aqua-

culture

The Rise of Large-scale Agricultural Management Subject and the Breakthrough of Agricultural Transformation: with He Town as the Example 106

*Sun Xinhua*

Abstract: China's agriculture is undergoing rapid transformation. What's going on in He Town in the south of Anhui Province demonstrates that, pushed by the local government and driven by two kinds of capital, the disintegration of agricultural management subject is breaking through the bottleneck and a radical capitalization of China's agriculture is emerging. The rising large-scale farming subjects are not only replacing the old, small-scale ones and raising agricultural production efficiency, but also changing the relations of agricultural production, resulting in remarkable capitalization of agriculture and proletarianization of the farmers. These phenomena fly in the face of so-called "capitalization without proletarianization" proposed by Philip C. C. Huang and other scholars. Judged from the multifarious factors influencing agricultural transformation, it should be obvious that the driving forces behind the rise of large-scale management subjects and the capitalization of China's agriculture are strong. He Town is an example of capitalist transformation that has nationwide significance.

Keywords: agricultural transformation, large-scale management subject, agricultural capitalism, government intervention, driven by capital

Economists for Small-scale Agriculture and Class Analysts: Where do They Differ and Where do They Agree? 125

*Lin Chun*

## HUMANITIES

From Marriage Freedom to Marriage Autonomy: Marriage in A New Face in Shaanxi-Gansu-Ningxia Border Region in 1940s 131

*Cong Xiaoping*

Abstract: This research is based on the recent released archival documents produced by the High Court in the Shaanxi-Gansu-Ningxia Border Region during the 1940s. Through analysis of a number of legal cases on marriage disputes, this article challenges the previous scholarly assumption prevalent since the 1980s that the CCP failed at their promised project in liberating women. This article argues that in implementing the regulation, the legal system gradually developed a new principle of "self-determination" in judging marriage disputes by grant-

ing women litigants' choice regarding their marriages. The author argues that this new principle aimed to disentangle women from the old patriarchal system, therefore undermined patriarchal power, and empowered women. It composed a step forward toward women's acquisition of independence and right of choosing marriage mates in twentieth-century transformation.

Keywords: Shaan-Gan-Ning Border Region High Court, marriage regulation, marriage dispute, self-determined marriage, legal practice

### Why did Ultra-left Phenomena Happen during the Land Reform Campaign? 150

*Lian Rujian*

Abstract: The real purpose of the land reform campaign during the civil war was to start intensive internal struggle in order to destroy the traditional commonwealth and interpersonal network that might be an impediment to military mobilization and entice the peasants to join the army by giving them the confiscated products and creating high social pressure on them. To attain the goal of military mobilization, class struggle could sometimes be carried too far. This ultra-left phenomenon was not the mistake of any particular cadre, but was the necessary step taken by the revolutionary power to enforce military mobilization. However, the ultra-left phenomenon could have serious and negative repercussion if it was not effectively constrained. Hence the dilemma. In practice, the revolutionary power came up with a set of principles and methods to deal with this dilemma.

Keywords: land reform, ultra-left, military mobilization, campaign-styled governance

## ECONOMY AND SOCIETY

### Cultural Presentation of the "Liminal Ethnic Group": Based on Guangzhou's Local Comic Books 163

*Zhu Changqiao*

Abstract: Since 2010, a variety of activities with the purpose of cultural conservation have emerged in Guangzhou. These activities, under the slogan of native culture protection and participated mainly by young people, were considered as mimicking Hong Kong which also belongs to the same Cantonese culture circle. At the beginning of 2015, some Hongkongese took violent offensive against mainland tourists by attacking them and calling them parallel traders. This offensive, again participated mainly by young people, was interpreted as the initiative of the pro-native groups in response to the conflict between Hong Kong and mainland cultures, with Cantonese-speaking tourists being grouped into mainland culture. The paper chooses seven books created in Guangzhou, with native culture as the topic, and compares them with Hong Kong's comic books which also feature native culture. The analysis of these two genres shows how the young people of these two cities construct their own cultural identities, and what is the true motive behind the cultural conservation campaign launched by



these young people.

Keywords: liminality, ethnic group, the youth, native culture

## CRITIQUE

Some Thoughts on Wang Fansen's Book, *The Tenacious Bass*

184

*Liu Wei*

Abstract: *The Tenacious Bass* is a historiographical response to the so-called "Hamletian dilemma of Chinese culture" since recent times. In the book, the application of such concepts as "the non-traditionality of tradition" is thought-provoking, but is flawed with conceptual confusion and inadequate expression. In the exploration of the theory of "moral group", the book's serious misunderstanding of Wang Guowei's *On the Institutions of the Shang and Zhou Dynasties*, Tan Sitong's *A Study of Ren* and other classics betrays a strong tendency of using western theories to discipline Chinese studies and the problem of far-fetched conceptual alignments. Its misinterpretation of Liang Qichao's "consumptive transformation" reflects a limited stance, with the failure of transcending the "new vs. old" and "mainstream vs. non-mainstream" distinctions and reevaluating Chinese culture from a Chinese perspective. All that said, the book has great value for its non-linear causal view, which may be called "wind-styled way of thinking", and its comprehensive, flexible and free-flowing analytic style.

Keywords: Hamletian dilemma of Chinese culture, wind-styled way of thinking, theory of "moral group", consumptive transformation

## NOTES FROM READING

Reflecting on and Probing for Democracy

210

*Ou Shujun*

Abstract: In the past quarter of the century, democracy has won the day, with most countries in the world claiming themselves to be democracies. However, the glory is fleeting. In exactly the same period of time, the advancing step of western democracy starts faltering, and its theory is being challenged in an unprecedented way. The idol of democracy is entering into twilight, surrounded by more and more pessimistic views. Theorists of democracy have now started to reflect on the inherent deficiencies of representational democracy, rethink electoral democracy, and seek to return to real democracy by exploring various institutions that can involve the participation of the populace.

Keywords: real democracy, electoral democracy, sortitive democracy, crisis of democracy

Which Kind of Revolution and Whose Tradition? A Review of Elizabeth J. Perry's Book, *Anyuan, Mining China's Revolutionary Tradition* 219

*Tang Xiaobing*

Abstract: Elizabeth J. Perry's new book, *Anyuan—Mining China's Revolutionary Tradition*, is an attempt to reveal, through history's own logic, the process and evolution of China's revolution and the fighting over, revision and substitution of the historical memory of Anyuan revolution. Simply put, Perry finds herself in agreement with Anyuan's revolutionary pattern characterized by cooperation with local elite, flexible utilization of Chinese cultural tradition, non-violence, and worker education.

Keyword: cultural location, cultural control, historical memory





中和学院张子墓祭礼 余江苇 摄